



COMMUNITY EDUCATION COUNCIL DISTRICT 3

154 West 93rd Street New York, New York 10025 - Room 204 Tel (212) 678-2782 Fax (212) 678-2804 Email: CEC3@schools.nyc.gov

Kimberly Watkins
President

Kristen Berger
First Vice President

Manuel Casanova
Second Vice President

Lucas Liu
Treasurer

Genisha Metcalf
Secretary

Council Members: Inyanga Collins Daniel Katz Michael McCarthy Jean Moreland | **Ilene Altschul**
Dennis Morgan Jane Yan Sun Alana Metcalf, *student member* District 3 Community Superintendent

CEC3 Special Calendar Meeting on Middle School Admissions Changes

May 22, 2018, 6:30 PM

P.S. 163 - Auditorium

163 W. 97th St., NYC 10025

Minutes

(Approved as amended at the July 18th, 2018 Calendar Meeting of the Business, Special Calendar, Calendar Meeting by all council members present)

Special Calendar Meeting

❖ **Call to Order 6:45 PM**

❖ **Roll Call of Members** Kristen Berger, Lucas Liu, Mike McCarthy, Genisha Metcalf, Jean Moreland, Dennis Morgan, Jane Young, Kim Watkins (8)

Absent: Manuel Casanova, Inyanga Collins, Dan Katz, Alana Metcalf

DOE Staff: Ilene Altschul, D3 Superintendent, DJ Sheppard, D3 Family Leadership Coordinator

❖ **Middle School Admissions Changes Presentation** (*on file*) – Juliet Kaye & Matthew Brogini, DOE Office of Student Enrollment

President Watkins prefaced the presentation by stating that District 3 is the most segregated in the City and in the State of New York. In 1969, the UWS and Harlem were joined as one district. 1992 middle school choice was instituted. Across racial, social and academic lines there is a severe disparity in District 3. The citywide diversity initiative instituted last June and the change to blind admissions will hopefully change this. The Council does not have a roll in moving the initiative forward.

Supt. Altschul: This process has been going on for 2 years; it was started 2015-16 and the work with principals and schools has continued. This year we began thinking more strategically. Last week scenario A & B was presented and based on feedback we have received, we are presenting a 3rd Scenario, 'C'.

Supt. Altschul began and reiterated the DOE's commitment to diversity. 15 schools are screened / 3 unscreened.

Matt Brogini, Director of Middle School Admissions:

Previously Shared Scenarios A & B

Scenario A: Economic Needs Index (ENI) & State Test Scores. Based on weights, elementary school students are placed into 2 groups.

10% of seat offers at middle schools – Group A – highest level of need / lowest performing

15% of seat offers at middle schools – Group B – lower level of need / lower performing

75% of seats – remain the same – highest ranked students

Simulation showed there was an increase in families matching and increase in low performing students match.

Scenario B: Based on 4th grade final report card grades & State Test Scores:

30% of weight based on final 4th grade ELA & report card

30% on final 4th grade math report card

20% on NYS ELA test score

20% NYS Math test score

Based on weights, students were placed into two groups

Group A –10% of seat offers to middle schools - lowest performing students as measured by course grades & test scores

Group B – 15% or seat offers to middle schools. - lower performing students as measured by course grades & test scores

75% of seats remains the same

Simulation showed an increase in families matching.

Added Scenario C:

Scenario C – Free and Reduced Lunch eligibility and then a combination of course grades and state test scores.

30% of weight based on final 4th grade ELA report card

30% of weight based on final math report card

20% NYS math test score

20% NYS ELA test score

10% of seat offers at middle schools – Group A – highest level of need / lowest performing

15% of seat offers at middle schools – Group B – lower level of need / lower performing

75% of seats – remain the same – highest ranked students

Families as a whole were matched

Percentage of students falling below state test proficiency:

Scenario A – 70% of Group A and B scored level 1 or 2

Scenario B – 92% of Group A and B scored level 1 or 2

Scenario C – 88% of Group A and B scored level 1 or 2

Across the board, approximately 5% of students did not receive a match and that was consistent

Supt Altschul remarked that they anticipate more families matching to the schools than in the past.

Scenario A (ENI+State Test Scores) – saw an uptick in 3 middle schools, Booker T. Washington, Computer and West End Secondary, for this group e.g. in 2017, of 288 offers, Booker T. had 15% offers to group A or B. In this simulation that number rose to 26%. Computer School had 11% offers to this group in 2017, under the simulation in Scenario A, it was 26%.

Scenario B (Report cards+State Test Scores) – a similar pattern played out. This had the largest increase in groups A & B.

Scenario C (Free and Reduced Lunch+State Test Scores) – a similar pattern played out in the simulation

Principals:

Brian Zagar, Lafayette Academy: Supports any diversity in middle school. At Lafayette Academy, double ones and double fours are in the classroom together. Kids from various socio-economic areas are friends. It breaks down barriers and builds awareness. Its proven it works, Lafayette Academy has proven that.

Charles DeBerry, PS/IS 76: Supports proposal. All children deserve an education. At 76 we do not have diverse students. We don't have the perfect plan but if we continue to try to find it, we will never move ahead.

Carland Washington, West Prep: Supports proposal. Charter school were opened specifically in Harlem compounded by large schools like Booker T & Computer taking in largely white and Hispanic students. This is about separated schools, warehousing schools. In 2018 is it acceptable to have the most segregated school system in the city, state and country. Anyone who questions it has to ask themselves what are they supporting.

Kristina Jelinek, Dual Language Middle School: Supports the proposal with any one of the plans in place for the betterment of students.

Evelyn Lolis, PS 84: Students need to learn to communicate in a global world. Dual Language program moved from 345 to 700 students by next year. We want to represent the changes occurring in our school. It's the parents who made this happen. This is a great thing and will your child opportunity. This is a move toward diversity.

President Watkins calls for a moratorium on charter schools in District 3. to stop onslaught of charter school growth, e.g. Success Academy gained a 300 seat increase of Harlem Success Academy.

Supt. Altschul: Addressed the CEC's requests in their Chancellor letter and referred to the steps she and the DOE will take, i.e. around integration supports and resources, all schools will be attending anti-bias training and the DOE has a 23M investment in cultural responsiveness which we will take advantage of.

- All schools will have AIS or PPT (People Personnel Team) to track struggling students.
- IEP teachers, trained in many programs, will be working with these students to ensure that all students are receiving supports they need.
- They will be working closely with Manhattan Support Center to ensure all staff have support.
- A moratorium on charter schools is not a district level decision that must come from a higher level. She will continue to make that a priority and address the space and needs of our community developing a long term plan for Harlem schools.
- There is no plan to further expand pre-K as it's based on need. There are still seats unfilled.
- Guidance Counselors and Parent Coordinators will tour middle schools and report back to families

Middle School Chair Berger attended most of the 26 middle school meetings. Parents overwhelmingly support diversity in schools, but are concerned how it is implemented.

In response to council member question about what it takes to fall into one of the 4 groups Matt Broggini responded that there are ranges on each metric and there isn't a specific cutoff.

Other concerns of the council were that

- this is not moving the needle if you don't know why parents choose to move their students down district
- middle school choice benefits the advantaged
- how do we balance the way money is spent and earned within our schools.
- Until the DOE decides what diversity is, we will continue to visit this

❖ **Public Comment**

- i. Supports the process but concerned about resources so that both sides of the coin are successful.
- ii. Supports diversity in schools but troubled by how it's being done. The original proposal was on the table a long time and then pulled due to illegality. Urges CEC to delay decision.
- iii. How do you know who gets free and reduced lunch?
Matt Broggini: Families fill out lunch forms.
- iv. We need to do something; something is better than nothing. It's about equality and justice
- v. There are schools that are demanding PTA resources be redistributed.
Supt. Altschul: That would depend on the schools rubric.
- vi. The quality of education should not depend on parent resources.
- vii. Low performing students are negatively impacted when placed in a high performing environment
- viii. Shocking to see how segregated the district is. We need to give kids more equity.
Prefers Scenario A, it give parents a slight incentive.
- ix. Equality and Equity, we have schools that are 10% minority and schools that are 100% minority.
- x. Schools need to be able to attract
- xi. False equivalencies about opposition to anything. Focus on making good changes not just changes.
- xii. Supports initiative for diversity but not academic diversity. She likes plan C.
- xiii. Start funding schools fairly and equitably.
- xiv. Seems like there is 20% overstock of middle school seats
- xv. There are some good ideas but again, Harlem is an issue.
- xvi. We put our children in Harlem schools. It's school commitment, not school choice.
- xvii. It would be interesting to track how those kids are performing as they leave those schools.

- xviii. ELLs and IEPs, how does this plan address them? I did not hear a commitment to them.
Supt. Altschul: We have not left Students with IEPs out. We look at them very carefully. We do ensure they have choice. Every school is mandated to take 21% (district average) of the IEP populations. We don't target ELLS in our district because they are a small population, 6%. Center School does have an ICT class. Next year is their first year on SEMS. The following year they will have the diversity initiative. ELLS have to take the state test.
- xix. PTA fundraising commitment is hard, the burden is on a few.
- xx. What's the plan for measuring success? What does success look like? What gets measured gets addressed.

❖ **Adjournment 9:42P**